

## Appendix 2. Evidence Consolidation and Issues Analysis

### A2.1. Purpose

This appendix sets out the analytical process used to consolidate the core evidence underpinning the VMP. The analysis draws on three primary sources, which reflect the views of different stakeholder groups:

- Our Orkney, Our Story (OOOS) – community and industry
- Internal Operational Review (IOR) – Council services that support tourism
- Orkney Islands Visitor Survey 2024 (OIVS) – visitors

Secondary sources, including LPPs for Birsay, Dounby and Stenness (the only LPPs currently registered with the Council), and the Orkney Matters One (OM1) and Orkney Matters Two (OM2) engagement output are used to validate and support the findings. The appendix provides a transparent audit trail showing how issues were identified, assessed and consolidated across these sources.

### A2.2. Analytical approach

The analysis followed a structured process to ensure that issues were identified consistently across the core primary evidence sources and consolidated into a single, coherent set of findings. The approach comprised five stages.

#### (1) Extraction of issue statements

Relevant statements describing a problem, pressure or constraint were extracted from the three primary evidence sources. Descriptive content, impacts and proposed solutions were excluded at this stage.

#### (2) Review and consolidation of statements

Extracted statements were reviewed to remove duplication, merge closely related points and ensure clear, consistent wording. This step produced a distinct set of issue statements for each source.

#### (3) Distinction between issues and impacts

Each statement was tested to confirm that it described an underlying issue rather than a consequence, symptom or effect. Impact-only statements were removed or reclassified to ensure the analysis focused on root problems.

#### (4) Thematic coding

Each issue was assigned to a theme within the thematic codebook (as detailed in Section A2.4.2). Coding ensured consistency across sources and supported later consolidation.

#### (5) Preparation of the master issues list

Issues from OOOS, IOR and OIVS were combined into a single consolidated list.

### A2.3. Source-by-source issues lists

The following tables present the issue statements extracted from each primary evidence source before consolidation.

Table A2.1. Our Orkney, Our Story issues

| Issue                                                                                 | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Citation<br>(source: OOOS, Appendix 1) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| 1. <b>Lack of transparency and communication from the Council and Orkney Harbours</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Opaque decision-making:</b> Decisions about cruise capacities and spending of cruise income are not clearly communicated to the community.</li> <li>• <b>Inconsistent strategic approach:</b> Harbours' cruise growth strategy appears inconsistent with Council commitments to sustainable tourism, biodiversity and climate.</li> </ul> | pp. 2, 3, 18, 20, 26, 27, 32, 38, 41   |
| 2. <b>Community disempowerment and lack of genuine engagement</b>                     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Imposed decisions:</b> Tourism decisions are made without sufficient community involvement.</li> <li>• <b>Consultation fatigue:</b> Consultation exercises are tokenistic, rarely leading to meaningful change or genuine influence over outcomes.</li> </ul>                                                                             | pp. 7, 18, 24, 32                      |
| 3. <b>Absence of a coherent tourism strategy and clear leadership</b>                 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Fragmented governance:</b> No single organisation is accountable for tourism management, and the existing partnership structures are fragmented, risk averse and under-resourced.</li> <li>• <b>Lack of destination management function:</b> While there is sectoral representation, there is no coordination at system level.</li> </ul> | pp. 21, 23, 28, 31,32                  |
| 4. <b>Limited data to inform planning and management</b>                              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of evidence:</b> Reliable data on visitor numbers, behaviour, flows and impacts is lacking.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | pp. 32, 33                             |
| 5. <b>Lack of reinvestment of tourism income</b>                                      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Absence of tangible benefit:</b> There is a gap between the income generated by tourism and improvements experienced by the community.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                         | pp. 7, 15, 20                          |

| Issue                                                               | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Citation<br>(source: OOOS, Appendix 1) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
|                                                                     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Sustainable funding gap:</b> There is no transparent or coherent system to ensure that tourism income, especially from cruise ships, is ringfenced and reinvested in sustaining Orkney's infrastructure and services most impacted by visitor use</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                        |
| 6. <b>Excessive, unmanaged cruise and coach visitor volumes</b>     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Concentrated visitor arrivals:</b> Large volumes of day visitors arrive at the same times and locations.</li> <li>• <b>Unsuitable routing of large vehicles:</b> Coaches tours are routed along single-track and residential roads not designed for heavy vehicles.</li> <li>• <b>Inadequate visitor management at sensitive sites:</b> Active visitor management is either ineffective or absent at key visitor attractions.</li> <li>• <b>Limited visitor dispersal:</b> Visitor activity is concentrated at a small number of locations.</li> <li>• <b>Poorly managed cycling groups:</b> Cruise cycling groups operate without consistent adherence to local guidance on safe and appropriate road use.</li> </ul> | pp. 4, 10, 12, 28, 29, 31              |
| 7. <b>Insufficient visitor infrastructure and service provision</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Inadequate public toilet provision:</b> There are too few public toilets across Orkney, including at key sites and in town centres, and maintenance capacity is limited.</li> <li>• <b>Insufficient waste disposal infrastructure:</b> There are no suitable coach waste disposal points and limited options for motorhomes.</li> <li>• <b>Lack of dedicated in-person visitor information service:</b> There are no longer any visitor information centres in Orkney.</li> <li>• <b>Reduced health services availability:</b> Residents have difficulty accessing GP surgeries, pharmacies and hospital services during peak season, especially on busy cruise days.</li> </ul>                                       | pp. 4, 12, 14, 29, 30, 31              |

| Issue                                                                      | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Citation<br>(source: OOS, Appendix 1) |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 8. <b>Unsuitable roads network for modern tourism traffic</b>              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Unsustainable traffic volume and scale:</b> Existing roads, verges, and passing places are not designed or maintained to accommodate the scale and type of modern tourist and local traffic, including heavy vehicles such as coaches and motorhomes</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | pp. 14, 30, 43                        |
| 9. <b>Limited public bus capacity on cruise days</b>                       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Overcrowded buses:</b> Residents are either unable to access or face long waits for scheduled services such as the X1 on busy cruise days.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | pp. 14, 15, 29                        |
| 10. <b>Limited inter-island ferry capacity in peak season</b>              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Booking difficulties:</b> Residents are often unable to secure ferry space for essential travel during peak season, including short notice bookings.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | pp. 3, 15, 26, 42                     |
| 11. <b>Insufficient cycle paths and footpaths</b>                          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of safe routes:</b> There is a lack of safe walking and cycling routes between towns and visitor sites, especially Kirkwall-Stromness and Stenness-Brodgar.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | pp. 14, 30, 44                        |
| 12. <b>Environmental damage by volume tourism</b>                          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Erosion of sensitive sites:</b> High visitor footfall, combined with littering and outdoor toileting, is eroding natural and cultural heritage sites.</li> <li>• <b>Localised air quality concerns:</b> Cruise ship emissions and idling vehicles generate air quality and climate concerns.</li> <li>• <b>Noise and disturbance near sensitive sites and residential areas:</b> Frequent vehicle movements and engine idling create persistent noise and localised pollution.</li> </ul> | pp. 10, 17, 18, 23, 29                |
| 13. <b>Exacerbation of residential housing shortage by short-term lets</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Growth in short-term lets:</b> Increasing numbers of residential properties are being converted to short-term lets.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | pp. 16, 17, 25                        |

| Issue                                                                    | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Citation<br>(source: OOS, Appendix 1) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 14. <b>Irresponsible visitor behaviour and lack of respect for place</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Disrespectful actions:</b> Visitors step into roads, block traffic, enter sacred or restricted spaces during events, and assume unrestricted access to areas that are private, sensitive or unsafe.</li> <li>• <b>Improper site use:</b> Motorhomes stay overnight in car parks not designed or serviced for such use, including beaches and beauty spots, and other non-designated areas.</li> <li>• <b>Irresponsible waste disposal:</b> Visitors frequently engage in littering, outdoor toileting, and improper waste disposal in areas where adequate facilities are lacking.</li> </ul> | pp. 11, 13, 16, 23, 29                |

Table A2.2. Internal Operational Review issues

| Issue                                                                                        | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. <b>Limited data to inform effective planning, resource management and decision-making</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of visitor flow and usage data:</b> Visitor numbers, footfall and usage patterns are not consistently collected or reported, and coach movements and visitation patterns are not tracked.</li> <li>• <b>Limited measurement of tourism impacts:</b> There is little quantified evidence on how tourism affects staff time, budgets or service disruption.</li> <li>• <b>Weaknesses in data sharing and segmentation:</b> Existing systems rarely distinguish between residents and visitors, and there is limited interoperability between services.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                     |
| 2. <b>Fragmented responsibility for infrastructure that visitors use</b>                     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Dispersed responsibility for car parks:</b> Responsibility sits across multiple services, and many car parks, including those at beaches, toilets and honeypot sites, have no dedicated budget for management or maintenance, with no coordinated approach across services.</li> <li>• <b>Split responsibility for toilet maintenance and cleaning:</b> Different services manage maintenance and cleaning, reflecting staffing and operational constraints.</li> <li>• <b>Lack of cross-service coordination on infrastructure used by visitors:</b> There is no mechanism for ongoing, strategic coordination across services to address tourism impacts on infrastructure.</li> </ul> |

| Issue                                                                | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3. <b>Insufficient staffing capacity to manage tourism pressures</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Statutory workload pressures:</b> Statutory regulatory workloads necessarily take precedence over non-statutory tourism-related activity.</li> <li>• <b>Recruitment constraints:</b> Recruitment challenges for specialist roles constrain flexibility to respond to tourism pressures.</li> <li>• <b>Limited capacity to pursue funding:</b> Staffing constraints limit the capacity available for pursuing income generation and external funding opportunities.</li> <li>• <b>Limited operational resilience:</b> Operational resilience at Council-operated museums and heritage sites is constrained during periods of unexpected visitor pressures or unplanned events.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 4. <b>Critical gaps in tourism policy frameworks</b>                 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of a clear tourism strategy framework:</b> There is no current, actionable tourism strategy with defined responsibilities, delivery mechanisms or a destination-level approach, leaving the Council without a clear framework for its role and expectations in wider destination management.</li> <li>• <b>Absence of a formal cruise strategy:</b> There is no formal cruise strategy despite cruise visitors representing a significant proportion of total visitor numbers and generating concentrated volume tourism impacts.</li> <li>• <b>Ambiguity over the use of Harbours revenue:</b> There is uncertainty about the extent to which Harbour Authority cruise revenues can be used for infrastructure or services beyond core Harbour Authority functions.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 5. <b>Transport capacity and connectivity constraints</b>            | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Public bus capacity pressure:</b> Seasonal visitor demand, especially on cruise days and to honeypot sites, regularly exceeds capacity on key bus routes (notably the X1), and the new national £2 fare subsidy is expected to intensify demand and exacerbate these pressures.</li> <li>• <b>Inter-island ferry capacity pressure:</b> Seasonal visitor demand adds pressure to lifeline routes already operating at or near capacity, with deck space oversubscription occurring services to popular destinations.</li> <li>• <b>Limited ferry resilience:</b> Spare vessel capacity and availability are limited, especially during the peak visitor season, and flexibility is further reduced when ferries are withdrawn for refit or repair.</li> <li>• <b>Lack of multimodal integration:</b> Alignment between ferries, buses, flights, both internal and external, is poor, and timetable and onward travel information is confusing.</li> <li>• <b>Unsuitable visitor information:</b> Bus timetables are complex and not designed for visitor use.</li> </ul> |

| Issue                                                                           | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 6. <b>Unsustainable seasonal traffic demands on the roads network</b>           | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Heavy traffic and large vehicle impacts:</b> High traffic volumes and heavy vehicle use are eroding roads not designed for current demand, particularly coaches on B-roads and single-track routes.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 7. <b>Directional signage deficiencies</b>                                      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Ineffective directional signage:</b> Directional signage is inconsistent and unclear in places.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 8. <b>Insufficient capacity to maintain and manage the Core Paths network</b>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Limited maintenance capacity and budget:</b> Internal maintenance resource and the available revenue budget are insufficient to sustain routine upkeep and of ageing and increasingly inaccessible paths infrastructure, with major repairs absorbing most available funding.</li> <li>• <b>Inaccurate and uncoordinated route information:</b> Signage and information panels are outdated or inconsistent, and visitor information promoted by third-party platforms without Council consultation does not reflect current route conditions or access arrangements.</li> <li>• <b>Network access constraints:</b> Access to some paths is restricted by limited nearby parking and public transport links, and non-circular routes.</li> </ul> |
| 9. <b>Lack of meaningful and ongoing engagement with communities on tourism</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Limited capacity for coordinated, proactive communication:</b> Tourism-related messaging is often reactive and driven by complaints, with limited officer capacity for proactive communication.</li> <li>• <b>Limited meaningful dialogue with communities:</b> Dialogue between the Council and communities is limited, with many feeling their views are not heard.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 10. <b>Seasonal strain on operational infrastructure and services</b>           | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Increased waste and cleansing demand:</b> Increased summer visitor volumes place additional pressure on public bins, street cleansing, and commercial waste collection.</li> <li>• <b>Parking and access challenges:</b> Car parks at honeypot sites and transport hubs are congested during peak visitor periods, especially on cruise days.</li> <li>• <b>Capacity constraints in health services:</b> Visitor demand, particularly on busy cruise days, places sustained pressure on A&amp;E and community pharmacy services.</li> <li>• <b>Servicing demands on public toilets:</b> Stand-alone public toilets and toilet facilities in public buildings require more frequent cleaning during peak visitor periods.</li> </ul>              |

| Issue                                                                | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 11. <b>Insufficient toilet provision at key visitor sites</b>        | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Capacity constraints at existing facilities:</b> Toilet facilities in popular historic buildings, such as St Magnus Cathedral, cannot meet current visitor demand, and expansion is constrained by listed building preservation requirements.</li> <li>• <b>Absence of facilities at key natural and heritage sites:</b> Provision of public toilets at certain key sites, such as the Ring of Brodgar, is constrained by multiple natural and historic environment designations and the absence of essential supporting infrastructure.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                  |
| 12. <b>Visitor concentrations at key sites</b>                       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Vulnerability of natural and cultural heritage sites:</b> Popular sites were not designed as visitor attractions and are not equipped to accommodate large volumes of visitors.</li> <li>• <b>Crowding at honeypot sites:</b> High visitor concentrations crowd key sites, particularly on cruise days.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 13. <b>Irresponsible visitor and business behaviour</b>              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Informal motorhome stays:</b> Overnight motorhome stays in non-designated areas generate recurring noise, waste and access issues, with reports of confrontation between visitors and residents.</li> <li>• <b>Inappropriate toileting:</b> Outdoor toileting occurs at visitor sites where no public toilet facilities are available.</li> <li>• <b>Lack of scheduled toilet stops:</b> Some cruise ship shore excursion operators do not consistently include toilet stops in their itineraries.</li> <li>• <b>Improper commercial waste disposal:</b> Some businesses dispose of their waste at domestic waste sites or through the domestic waste collection service.</li> </ul> |
| 14. <b>Insufficient and fragmented visitor information provision</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Misplaced visitor enquiries:</b> Visitor enquiries are directed to services not designed or resourced for visitor information, including libraries, operational transport staff and other public-facing services.</li> <li>• <b>Inadequate service information:</b> Information on Council services and facilities used by visitors is inconsistent, sometimes hard to find and not always easy for visitors to interpret.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

| Issue                                                                             | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 15. <b>Insufficient responsible tourism messaging for visitors and businesses</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Inconsistent messaging:</b> The Council does not consistently promote responsible behaviour as a standard expectation when visitors use its services and facilities.</li> <li>• <b>Absence of coordinated messaging:</b> There is no coordinated messaging that communicates Orkney's remote island context and expected responsible behaviour to visitors, cruise lines and tour operators.</li> <li>• <b>Insufficient guidance for local businesses:</b> Businesses do not receive clear, consistent guidance on their responsibilities in exemplifying responsible behaviour and supporting responsible tourism.</li> </ul> |
| 16. <b>Misalignment of destination marketing with strategic planning</b>          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Uncoordinated marketing:</b> Destination marketing is not consistently aligned with Council strategic tourism planning and development activity.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

Table A2.3. Orkney Islands Visitor Survey 2024 issues

| Issue                                                             | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Citation<br>(source: <a href="#">OIVS</a> ) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| 1. <b>Overcrowding at key sites</b>                               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>High day visitor volumes:</b> Large numbers of cruise ship and coach passengers create crowding at popular attractions such as Skara Brae, St Magnus Cathedral and the Orkney Museum.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                     | p.66, 81, 82                                |
| 2. <b>Limited availability and opening of visitor services</b>    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Limited food and drink options:</b> Few restaurants or cafés are available, particularly outside Kirkwall and Stromness.</li> <li>• <b>Restricted opening hours:</b> Many food and drink establishments and attractions are closed outside standard hours.</li> <li>• <b>Seasonal closures:</b> Some attractions and hospitality businesses close during off-peak periods</li> </ul> | pp.73, 82, 84, 88, 101                      |
| 3. <b>Insufficient visitor accommodation supply and diversity</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Limited accommodation options:</b> Some visitors struggle to find suitable accommodation, even when booking well in advance.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | pp.82, 84                                   |

| Issue                                                    | Details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Citation<br>(source:<br><u>OIVS</u> ) |
|----------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
|                                                          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Lack of budget and alternative accommodation:</b> There is a shortage of small self-catering options such as huts, pods, glamping, and low-budget accommodation like hostels.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                              |                                       |
| 4. <b>Insufficient public transport and connectivity</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Poor public transport coordination:</b> Bus and ferry timetables are not well coordinated, making travel between islands or to/from ferries challenging.</li> <li>• <b>Limited sustainable travel options:</b> Limited pedestrian, cycling or public transport options make it difficult for visitors without cars to explore the islands.</li> </ul> | pp.83, 88                             |
| 5. <b>Limited public toilet facilities</b>               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Insufficient public toilets:</b> There are not enough or poor-quality public toilet facilities.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | pp.83                                 |
| 6. <b>Poor road signage and wayfinding</b>               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Unclear road signage:</b> Road signs and directions to attractions are often unclear or in poor condition, making navigation difficult for visitors.</li> <li>• <b>Inadequate wayfinding:</b> Signage limits visitors' ability to locate parking areas and access walking routes.</li> </ul>                                                          | p.84                                  |

## A2.4. Consolidation outputs

### A2.4.1. Evidence source mapping

The following table shows which issues appear in each primary evidence source, highlighting areas of convergence across OOOS, IOR and OIVS.

Table A2.4. Evidence source mapping

| Consolidated issue |                                                                             | OOOS | IOR | OIVS |
|--------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|-----|------|
| 1.                 | Critical gaps in tourism destination governance and strategic frameworks    | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 2.                 | Community disempowerment and lack of genuine engagement on tourism          | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 3.                 | Environmental damage by volume tourism                                      | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 4.                 | Excessive cruise and coach visitor volumes at key sites                     | ✓    | ✓   | ✓    |
| 5.                 | Insufficient cycle paths and footpaths                                      | ✓    |     |      |
| 6.                 | Insufficient public toilets provision in key locations                      | ✓    | ✓   | ✓    |
| 7.                 | Irresponsible visitor and business behaviour                                | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 8.                 | Lack of transparency and communication from the Council and Orkney Harbours | ✓    |     |      |
| 9.                 | Limited data to inform effective planning and management                    | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 10.                | Limited inter-island ferry capacity in peak season                          | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 11.                | Limited public bus capacity on cruise days                                  | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 12.                | Reduced and fragmented visitor information provision                        | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 13.                | Unsuitable roads network for modern tourism traffic demands                 | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 14.                | Unmanaged volume tourism                                                    | ✓    |     |      |
| 15.                | Insufficient responsible tourism messaging for visitors and businesses      |      | ✓   |      |
| 16.                | Insufficient waste disposal infrastructure for coaches and motorhomes       | ✓    |     |      |
| 17.                | Exacerbation of residential housing shortage by short-term lets             | ✓    |     |      |
| 18.                | Fragmented Council responsibility for infrastructure that visitors use      |      | ✓   |      |
| 19.                | Insufficient visitor accommodation supply and diversity                     |      |     | ✓    |
| 20.                | Inefficient public transport connectivity                                   |      | ✓   | ✓    |

| Consolidated issue |                                                                           | OOOS | IOR | OIVS |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|-----|------|
| 21.                | Insufficient Council staffing capacity to manage tourism pressures        |      | ✓   |      |
| 22.                | Lack of reinvestment of tourism income                                    | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 23.                | Limited availability and opening of visitor services                      |      | ✓   | ✓    |
| 24.                | Misalignment of destination marketing with strategic planning             |      | ✓   |      |
| 25.                | Seasonal pressure on health services                                      | ✓    | ✓   |      |
| 26.                | Seasonal strain on parking availability, site access and toilet servicing |      | ✓   |      |
| 27.                | Directional signage and wayfinding deficiencies                           |      | ✓   | ✓    |
| 28.                | Insufficient capacity to maintain and manage the Core Paths network       |      | ✓   |      |

#### A2.4.2. Thematic codebook

The following table sets out the thematic codes used to group issues across sources.

Table A2.5. Thematic codebook

| Theme                                                | Code | Issue Focus                                                                                                                                   |
|------------------------------------------------------|------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Governance, strategy and transparency             | GST  | Leadership, strategic planning, decision-making, transparency, reinvestment of tourism income                                                 |
| 2. Visitor information, behaviour and communications | VBC  | Visitor and business behaviour, responsible tourism messaging, availability and quality of visitor information and access to visitor services |
| 3. Transport, roads and movement                     | TRM  | Road network suitability, public bus and ferry capacity, footpaths and cycle paths, wayfinding and connectivity between transport modes       |
| 4. Volume tourism management                         | VTM  | Operational management of high-volume, time-concentrated visitor flows                                                                        |
| 5. Essential infrastructure                          | EIF  | Adequacy, resilience and servicing of, and access to, infrastructure used by residents and visitors                                           |
| 6. Visitor accommodation and residential housing     | VAH  | Availability, diversity and affordability of visitor accommodation and impacts of tourism accommodation on residential housing supply         |
| 7. Internal Council administration                   | ICA  | Internal processes, staffing capacity and cross-service coordination                                                                          |

A2.4.3. Consolidated master issues list

The following table presents the consolidated issues list produced through the evidence consolidation process.

Table A2.6. Consolidated issues

| Consolidated Issue                                                                 | Short details                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Theme |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| 1. <b>Critical gaps in tourism destination governance and strategic frameworks</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• fragmented governance</li> <li>• no destination management function</li> <li>• absence of clear tourism and cruise strategy frameworks</li> </ul>                                                                                                    | GST   |
| 2. <b>Community disempowerment and lack of genuine engagement on tourism</b>       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• decisions made without sufficient community involvement</li> <li>• consultation fatigue</li> <li>• reactive and uncoordinated communication</li> <li>• limited dialogue between the Council and communities</li> </ul>                               | GST   |
| 3. <b>Environmental damage by volume tourism</b>                                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• erosion of sensitive sites</li> <li>• littering and outdoor toileting</li> <li>• localised air quality concerns</li> <li>• noise and disturbance near sensitive sites and residential areas</li> </ul>                                               | VTM   |
| 4. <b>Excessive cruise and coach visitor volumes at key sites</b>                  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• popular sites not designed as visitor attractions</li> <li>• high cruise visitor volumes</li> <li>• concentrated visitor arrivals</li> </ul>                                                                                                         | VTM   |
| 5. <b>Insufficient cycle paths and footpaths</b>                                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• lack of safe routes between towns and visitor sites</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                       | TRM   |
| 6. <b>Insufficient public toilets provision in key locations</b>                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• too few public toilets at key sites and town centres</li> <li>• limited maintenance capacity</li> <li>• constraints at heritage sites</li> </ul>                                                                                                     | EIF   |
| 7. <b>Irresponsible visitor and business behaviour</b>                             | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• disrespectful actions</li> <li>• improper site use and waste disposal</li> <li>• informal motorhome stays</li> <li>• littering and outdoor toileting</li> <li>• lack of scheduled toilet stops in some cruise shore excursion itineraries</li> </ul> | VBC   |

| Consolidated Issue                                                                    | Short details                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Theme |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| 8. <b>Lack of transparency and communication from the Council and Orkney Harbours</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• opaque decision-making</li> <li>• unclear cruise capacity decisions</li> <li>• inconsistent strategic approach</li> </ul>                                                                     | GST   |
| 9. <b>Limited data to inform effective planning and management</b>                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• lack of visitor flow and usage data</li> <li>• limited impact measurement</li> <li>• systems weaknesses in data sharing and segmentation</li> </ul>                                           | GST   |
| 10. <b>Limited inter-island ferry capacity in peak season</b>                         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• booking difficulties</li> <li>• limited deck space</li> <li>• reduced system resilience</li> </ul>                                                                                            | TRM   |
| 11. <b>Limited public bus capacity on cruise days</b>                                 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• overcrowded buses</li> <li>• resident displacement</li> <li>• long waits on busy cruise days</li> </ul>                                                                                       | TRM   |
| 12. <b>Reduced and fragmented visitor information provision</b>                       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• closure of visitor information centres</li> <li>• enquiries diverted to non-tourism services</li> <li>• inconsistent information</li> </ul>                                                   | VBC   |
| 13. <b>Unsuitable roads network for modern tourism traffic demands</b>                | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• roads infrastructure not designed or maintained for current traffic volumes and vehicle types</li> </ul>                                                                                      | TRM   |
| 14. <b>Unmanaged volume tourism</b>                                                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• unsuitable routing of coach tours</li> <li>• inadequate visitor management at sensitive sites</li> <li>• limited visitor dispersal</li> <li>• poorly managed cruise cycling groups</li> </ul> | VTM   |
| 15. <b>Insufficient responsible tourism messaging for visitors and businesses</b>     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• inconsistent and uncoordinated messaging</li> <li>• insufficient guidance for businesses in modelling and supporting responsible tourism</li> </ul>                                           | VBC   |
| 16. <b>Insufficient waste disposal infrastructure for coaches and motorhomes</b>      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• no coach waste disposal points</li> <li>• limited motorhome disposal options</li> </ul>                                                                                                       | EIF   |

| Consolidated Issue                                                                | Short details                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Theme |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| 17. <b>Exacerbation of residential housing shortage by short-term lets</b>        | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• growth in conversion of residential properties to short-term lets</li> </ul>                                                                                                                    | VAH   |
| 18. <b>Fragmented Council responsibility for infrastructure that visitors use</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• split internal responsibility for managing and maintaining car parks and toilets</li> <li>• no coordinated cross-service approach</li> </ul>                                                    | ICA   |
| 19. <b>Insufficient visitor accommodation supply and diversity</b>                | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• limited accommodation options</li> <li>• lack of budget and alternative accommodation</li> </ul>                                                                                                | VAH   |
| 20. <b>Inefficient public transport connectivity</b>                              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• poor timetable coordination</li> <li>• lack of multimodal integration</li> <li>• limited sustainable travel options</li> </ul>                                                                  | TRM   |
| 21. <b>Insufficient Council staffing capacity to manage tourism pressures</b>     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• statutory workload pressures</li> <li>• recruitment challenges</li> <li>• limited capacity to pursue funding</li> <li>• limited operational resilience at museums and heritage sites</li> </ul> | ICA   |
| 22. <b>Lack of reinvestment of tourism income</b>                                 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• absence of tangible community benefit</li> <li>• unclear reinvestment</li> <li>• ambiguity over Harbours cruise revenue use</li> </ul>                                                          | GST   |
| 23. <b>Limited availability and opening of visitor services</b>                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• few venues outside main towns</li> <li>• restricted hours</li> <li>• seasonal closures</li> </ul>                                                                                               | VBC   |
| 24. <b>Misalignment of destination marketing with strategic planning</b>          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• marketing not aligned with Council strategic tourism planning and development activity</li> </ul>                                                                                               | GST   |
| 25. <b>Seasonal pressure on health services</b>                                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A&amp;E and community pharmacy capacity constraints, particularly on cruise days</li> </ul>                                                                                                     | VTM   |

| Consolidated Issue                                                                   | Short details                                                                                                                                                                               | Theme |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| 26. <b>Seasonal strain on parking availability, site access and toilet servicing</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• increased waste and cleansing demand</li> <li>• congested car parks and transport hubs</li> <li>• servicing pressures on public toilets</li> </ul> | EIF   |
| 27. <b>Directional signage and wayfinding deficiencies</b>                           | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• unclear or inconsistent road signage and wayfinding</li> </ul>                                                                                     | TRM   |
| 28. <b>Insufficient capacity to maintain and manage the Core Paths network</b>       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• limited maintenance capacity and budget</li> <li>• inaccurate and uncoordinated route information</li> <li>• access constraints</li> </ul>         | TRM   |

## A2.5. Triangulation with secondary research

### A2.5.1. Role of secondary research

Secondary research sources, including LPPs for Birsay, Dounby and Stenness as well as OM1 and OM2, were reviewed to assess the extent to which they corroborate, contextualise or challenge the issues identified from the three primary evidence sources (OOOS, IOR, OIVS). These secondary sources do not alter confidence ratings, which are determined solely by convergence across the primary sources, but they provide an important additional layer of validation and contextual insight.

### A2.5.2. Findings

Triangulation confirms that the secondary sources broadly support the consolidated issues list. They reinforce the following themes, in particular, and provide localised examples that strengthen interpretation of the primary evidence.

- **Lack of transparency and meaningful community involvement in decision-making** – Secondary evidence refers to frustration with Council engagement and a desire for more meaningful involvement (OM2), and calls for transparent, inclusive processes and stronger local influence (Stenness LPP).
- **Peak season pressure on core infrastructure and services** – Congestion, informal parking and safety concerns are reported on rural roads (Birsay LPP; OM2), alongside limited public transport capacity and infrequent services, deteriorating road surfaces and drainage issues requiring more regular maintenance (Birsay LPP; Stenness LPP; OM2), and insufficient public toilet provision and maintenance at key sites (Birsay LPP; OM2).
- **Environmental degradation at sensitive sites** – Erosion, littering and outdoor toileting are reported at key locations (Birsay LPP; Stenness LPP), together with heavy visitor footfall damage to paths, World Heritage Site monuments and surrounding landscapes (OM2).
- **Irresponsible visitor behaviour** – Littering, outdoor toileting, inappropriate parking and access conflicts occur at popular locations (Birsay LPP; Stenness LPP; OM2), with particular concern during peak season (OM2).
- **Reduced housing for residents** – Short-term lets have reduced the availability of residential housing in several communities (Dounby LPP; Stenness LPP), while seasonal accommodation shortages limit options for workers and young people (OM1).
- **Insufficient active travel and paths infrastructure** – Communities identify gaps in safe walking and cycling routes and highlight the need for improved active travel and paths provision to provide for both residents and visitors (Birsay LPP; Stenness LPP; OM2).

No additional issues emerged from secondary research that were not already captured in the primary evidence. Instead, secondary sources reinforced the existing issues and clarified how they manifest in different local contexts.

### A2.5.3. Influence on the analysis

Triangulation of secondary research influenced the analysis in three ways:

- (1) Validation confirmed that the issues identified through primary evidence are consistent with wider community issues.
- (2) Contextual refinement provided additional detail that informed the short details column in the consolidated master issues Table A2.6 in Section A2.4.3.
- (3) Assurance confirmed that the consolidated issues list is not driven by any single dataset but is supported across multiple evidence sources.

### **A2.6. Summary**

The secondary sources provide strong contextual support for the issues identified through the primary evidence sources. While they do not alter confidence ratings, they reinforce the relevance, materiality and persistence of the issues across communities. This triangulation confirms that the consolidated issues list is robust, comprehensive and aligned with community concerns.