

Minute

Planning Committee

Monday, 28 October 2024, 14:00.

Council Chamber, Council Offices, School Place, Kirkwall.



Present

Councillors Owen Tierney, David Dawson, P Lindsay Hall, W Leslie Manson, James R Moar, Janette A Park, Raymond S Peace, Jean E Stevenson, Ivan A Taylor and Duncan A Tullock.

Present via remote link (Microsoft Teams)

Councillor John A R Scott.

Clerk

- Katy Russell-Duff, Committees Officer.

In Attendance

- Roddy Mackay, Head of Planning and Community Protection.
- Hazel Flett, Service Manager (Governance).
- Jamie Macvie, Service Manager (Development Management).
- Derek Manson, Team Manager (Development Planning).
- Paul Maxton, Solicitor.
- Donald Wilson, Roads Authority Officer.

Observing

- Isla McLeod, Graduate Planner.
- Josh Rendall, Graduate Planner.
- Shanka Weerasekara, Graduate Planner.

Declarations of Interest

- No declarations of interest were intimated.

Chair

- Councillor Owen Tierney.

1. Planning Application 24/147/PP

Proposed Demolition of House (Former Cottages) and Erection of Four Terraced Houses at Balfour Cottage, Sandyhill Road, Shapinsay

David Campbell and Barry Moncrieff, representing the applicant, Shapinsay Development Trust, were present during consideration of this item.

After consideration of a report by the Corporate Director for Neighbourhood Services and Infrastructure, copies of which had been circulated, the Committee:

Noted:

1.1. That a letter of objection relating to the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal to demolish a house (former cottages) and erect four terraced houses at Balfour Cottage, Sandyhill Road, Shapinsay, had been received from Glenn Wilson, 12 Millbank, Shapinsay.

After hearing a report from the Service Manager (Development Management), and after hearing representations from David Campbell, representing the applicant, Shapinsay Development Trust, Councillor David Dawson, seconded by Councillor Ivan A Taylor, moved that the application for the proposed demolition of a house (former cottages) and erection of four terraced houses at Balfour Cottage, Sandyhill Road, Shapinsay, be refused, as proposed by officers.

Councillor Jean E Stevenson, seconded by Councillor P Lindsay Hall, moved an amendment that the application for the proposed demolition of a house (former cottages) and erection of four terraced houses at Balfour Cottage, Sandyhill Road, Shapinsay, be approved.

On a vote being taken 7 members voted for the amendment and 4 for the motion, and the Committee:

Resolved, in terms of delegated powers:

1.2. That the concerns of the objector had been considered in the assessment of the proposal but were, in the Committee's opinion, of insufficient weight to warrant refusal.

1.3. That, after fully assessing the proposed development in relation to the undernoted policies, planning permission be granted in respect of the proposal to demolish a house (former cottages) and erect four terraced houses at Balfour Cottage, Sandyhill Road, Shapinsay, subject to conditions:

- National Planning Framework 4:
 - Policy 3 – Biodiversity.
 - Policy 7 – Historic assets and places.
 - Policy 9 – Brownfield, vacant and derelict land and empty building.
 - Policy 17 – Rural homes.

- Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:
 - Policy 1 – Criteria for All Development.
 - Policy 2 – Design.
 - Policy 5 – Housing.
 - Policy 8 – Historic Environment and Cultural Heritage.
 - Policy 14 – Transport, Travel and Road Network Infrastructure.
- Supplementary Guidance:
 - Historic Environment and Cultural Heritage (2017).

1.4. That the Committee's reasons for granting planning permission, against the recommendation of the Corporate Director for Neighbourhood Services and Infrastructure, were that:

- The proposed development, which would sub-divide and refurbish the property to create a terrace of up to four self-contained one- or two-bedroom dwellings, supported an identified local housing need and would contribute towards local living thereby helping sustain a fragile community.
- The former cottages had been altered over time with extensions, installation of late 20th century windows, doors, harling and the merging of the cottages into a single house, and the proposed erection of a terrace of four houses on the same site did not substantively depart from the existing pattern or style of development with the design being acceptable in terms of scale, massing, form, proportions, materials and finishes.
- The application site was located outwith the boundary of the Balfour Castle Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscape, and the proposed development did not compromise the cultural significance, character and integrity of the designation, and would not significantly impact on important views to, from and within the designated site, or its setting.
- Whilst retention of the existing building instead of demolition would be the favoured option, in this instance it was not considered that the condition of the building made it suitable for renovation given the extensive works required; and, as an embodied and whole life carbon analysis to compare demolition and replacement with a new carbon efficient building had not been undertaken, there was insufficient information available to conclude that retention of the existing building offered the best outcome in terms of conserving embodied energy.

And, accordingly, the proposed development complied with the following policies:

- National Planning Framework 4:
 - Policy 3 – Biodiversity.
 - Policy 7 – Historic assets and places.
 - Policy 9 – Brownfield, vacant and derelict land and empty building.
 - Policy 17 – Rural homes.

- Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:
 - Policy 1 – Criteria for All Development.
 - Policy 2 – Design.
 - Policy 5 – Housing.
 - Policy 8 – Historic Environment and Cultural Heritage.
 - Policy 14 – Transport, Travel and Road Network Infrastructure.
- Supplementary Guidance:
 - Historic Environment and Cultural Heritage (2017).

1.5. That powers be delegated to the Corporate Director for Neighbourhood Services and Infrastructure to determine appropriate conditions to attach to the decision notice, which should include the following:

- Provision of a footway linking the development to Millbank.
- Upgrading the access to Roads Services' standards.
- Provision for refuse collection.

2. Conclusion of Meeting

At 15:30 the Chair declared the meeting concluded.

Signed: Owen Tierney.