

## **Minute**

### **Planning Committee**

Wednesday, 3 July 2019, 10:30.

Council Chamber, Council Offices, School Place, Kirkwall.



### **Present**

Councillors Robin W Crichton, John A R Scott, Alexander G Cowie, Norman R Craigie, David Dawson, Barbara Foulkes, Stephen Sankey, Graham L Sinclair, Magnus O Thomson, Owen Tierney, Duncan A Tullock and Kevin F Woodbridge.

### **Clerk**

- Angela Kingston, Committees Officer.

### **In Attendance**

- Roddy Mackay, Head of Planning, Development and Regulatory Services.
- Jamie Macvie, Planning Manager (Development Management).
- Peter Trodden, Solicitor.

### **Observing**

- Susan Shearer, Senior Planner (Development and Marine Planning).
- Donald Wilson, Roads Authority Officer.

### **Declarations of Interest**

- No declarations of interest were intimated.

### **Chair**

- Councillor Robin W Crichton.

## **1. Planning Application 18/543/PP**

### **Proposed Creation of Caravan and Camping Site at Carness, St Ola**

Ruth Sinclair, representing the applicant, Firm of Carness Farm, Stephen Omand, agent for the applicant, and David Farquharson, objector, were present during consideration of this item.

After consideration of a report by the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure, copies of which had been circulated, and after hearing a report from the Planning Manager (Development Management), the Committee:

Noted:

1.1. That letters of objection relating to the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the creation of a caravan and camping site at Carness, St Ola, had been received from the following:

- David Farquharson, Norview, Carness Road, Kirkwall.
- Lynda Liddle, Saevermere, Carness Road, St Ola.
- Caroline Norquoy, Carbricole, Carness Road, St Ola.
- James Robertson, Vanskavaig, Carness Road, Kirkwall.
- David Work, Greenfield, Carness Road, St Ola.

After hearing representations from David Farquharson, objector, and from Stephen Omand, agent for the applicant, Firm of Carness Farm, Councillor Robin W Crichton, seconded by Councillor John A R Scott, moved that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the creation of a caravan and camping site at Carness, St Ola, be refused, for the reasons as proposed by officers.

Councillor Barbara Foulkes, seconded by Councillor Alexander G Cowie, moved an amendment that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the creation of a caravan and camping site at Carness, St Ola, be granted, subject to conditions, as, in their opinion:

(1) The sequential approach to development of commercial facilities applied by the Town Centre First Principle was not applicable in consideration of the type of development proposed, as it was not considered that it would attract significant footfall.

(2) The proposed development represented diversification of an existing rural business, and sufficient justification had been provided that there was a demonstrable locational requirement for a caravan and camping facility in a coastal location outwith the Kirkwall settlement boundary.

And, accordingly, the proposed development complied with the following policy of the Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:

- Policy 4 – Business, Industry and Employment, section B – In the Countryside, parts (i) and (ii).

On a vote being taken 8 members voted for the amendment and 4 for the motion. The amendment then became the motion.

Councillor Duncan A Tullock, seconded by Councillor Norman R Craigie, moved a further amendment, notice of which had been given, that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the creation of a caravan and camping site at Carness, St Ola, be deferred to enable the applicant to submit full details in respect of upgrades to the road serving the development.

On a vote being taken 5 members voted for the amendment and 7 for the motion, and the Committee:

Resolved, in terms of delegated powers:

**1.2.** That planning permission be granted in respect of the proposal for the creation of a caravan and camping site at Carness, St Ola.

**1.3.** That powers be delegated to the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure, in consultation with the Chair and Vice Chair of the Planning Committee, to finalise the conditions to be attached to the planning permission, referred to at paragraph 1.2 above, and thereafter issue the permission.

**1.4.** That the Committee's reasons for granting planning permission against the recommendation of the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure were that, in the Committee's opinion:

- The sequential approach to development of commercial facilities applied by the Town Centre First Principle was not applicable in consideration of the type of development proposed, as it was not considered that it would attract significant footfall.
- The proposed development represented diversification of an existing rural business, and sufficient justification had been provided that there was a demonstrable locational requirement for a caravan and camping facility in a coastal location outwith the Kirkwall settlement boundary.

And, accordingly, the proposed development complied with the following policy of the Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:

- Policy 4 – Business, Industry and Employment, section B – In the Countryside, parts (i) and (ii).

## **2. Planning Application 19/105/PP**

### **Proposed Demolition of Existing Building, Erection of Workshop, Gallery and Flat at Former Andersons Garage, St Mary's, Holm**

Celina Tomison, representing the applicants, Mr and Mrs Tomison, and Stephen Omand, agent for the applicants, were present during consideration of this item.

After consideration of a report by the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure, copies of which had been circulated, and after hearing a report from the Planning Manager (Development Management), and after hearing representations from Stephen Omand, agent for the applicants, Mr and Mrs G Tomison, Councillor Duncan A Tullock, seconded by Councillor David Dawson, moved that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for demolition of an existing building and erection of a workshop, gallery and flat at the Former Andersons Garage, St Mary's, Holm, be granted, subject to conditions, as, in their opinion:

(1) The proposed development was sited within the settlement boundary of St Mary's and the principle of demolition of the existing building, which could not be retained and reinstated at a reasonable economic cost, together with its replacement with a modern building, could be supported.

(2) The proposed redevelopment of a brownfield site occupied by a former garage and fuel station would have a positive effect on the appearance and amenity of the area.

(3) The design, scale, siting and form of the replacement building reflected the character of the surrounding area and was compatible with the streetscape of the village.

(4) The proposed development preserved the amenity of the surrounding area and would have no unacceptable adverse impacts on the amenity of adjacent and nearby properties.

(5) The proposed development was appropriately connected to vehicular and public transport routes.

And, accordingly, the proposed development complied with the following policies of the Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:

- Policy 1 – Criteria for All Development, parts (i), (ii) and (iv).
- Policy 2 – Design, parts (ii) and (iii).
- Policy 3 – Settlements, Town Centres and Primary Retail Frontages, section A – The Town Centre First Principle, part (i).
- Policy 4 – Business, Industry and Employment, section A – Within Settlements, part (iii).

Councillor Robin W Crichton, seconded by Councillor Owen Tierney, moved an amendment that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for demolition of an existing building and erection of a workshop, gallery and flat at Former Andersons Garage, St Mary's, Holm, be deferred to enable members of the Committee to undertake an unaccompanied site visit.

On a vote being taken 2 members voted for the amendment and 10 for the motion, and the Committee:

Resolved, in terms of delegated powers:

**2.1.** That planning permission be granted in respect of the proposal for demolition of an existing building and erection of a workshop, gallery and flat at the Former Andersons Garage, St Mary's, Holm.

**2.2.** That powers be delegated to the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure, in consultation with the Chair and Vice Chair of the Planning Committee, to finalise the conditions to be attached to the planning permission, referred to at paragraph 2.1 above, and thereafter issue the permission.

**2.3.** That the Committee's reasons for granting planning permission against the recommendation of the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure were that, in the Committee's opinion:

- The proposed development was sited within the settlement boundary of St Mary's and the principle of demolition of the existing building, which could not be retained and reinstated at a reasonable economic cost, together with its replacement with a modern building, could be supported.
- The proposed redevelopment of a brownfield site occupied by a former garage and fuel station would have a positive effect on the appearance and amenity of the area.
- The design, scale, siting and form of the replacement building reflected the character of the surrounding area and was compatible with the streetscape of the village.

- The proposed development preserved the amenity of the surrounding area and would have no unacceptable adverse impacts on the amenity of adjacent and nearby properties.
- The proposed development was appropriately connected to vehicular and public transport routes.

And, accordingly, the proposed development complied with the following policies of the Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:

- Policy 1 – Criteria for All Development, parts (i), (ii) and (iv).
- Policy 2 – Design, parts (ii) and (iii).
- Policy 3 – Settlements, Town Centres and Primary Retail Frontages, section A – The Town Centre First Principle, part (i).
- Policy 4 – Business, Industry and Employment, section A - Within Settlements, part (iii).

### **3. Conclusion of Meeting**

At 12:40 the Chair declared the meeting concluded.

Signed: Rob Crichton.